



Ecosystem Management Coordination **CARA** | Comment Analysis and Response Application

Response to Comment (By Author)

Project: Fightingtown Creek Early Successional Habitat Project (44961)

Comment Period: Scoping -

Period Dates: 8/17/2015 - 9/15/2015

Generated: 12/13/2016 10:11 AM

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Adams, Gary	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Adams, Ken	<p>I appreciate your intent to assist the grouse, but this area should not be destroyed for that purpose.</p> <p>Please avoid cutting healthy, mature forest, and instead cut young, degraded stands and</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Alexander, Joe	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Alexander, Pam	Please do not cut stands of trees with some over 75 years old. Instead, the Forest Service should consider cutting these young, 20, 30 year old degraded stands that were clear cut instead of healthy, mature forests to reach its goal.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Allen, Susan	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. Mature forests are necessary for wildlife and for human quality of life	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Altman, Carolyn	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Armistead, Virginia	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Artley, Dick	you claim you need to create between 192 and 484 acres of early successional wildlife habitat (ESH). You fail to 1) identify the wildlife species that are in trouble because of the absence of ESH, 2) how you know these species are in trouble in your local area, and 3) the other wildlife species in and near the sale area that could be harmed by clearcutting 436 acres	There is a abundance of late-successional forest (stands over 80 years old) in the project area (and across the larger landscape) which provides habitat for a wide variety of plants and animals. Not all species occur in the same ecological niche, however, and there are many species that utilize young forests for some of their life stages or seasons. This fact is reflected in the Land and Resource Management Plan for the Chattahoochee-Oconee National Forests; it contains objectives to create and/or maintain a range of forest successional stages in order to provide for the needs of area wildlife, including those that are disturbance-dependent. Management Prescription 9.H contains a target range of early successional stage forest (4-10% of the prescription area) in order to provide habitat for species that require this type of habitat.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Artley, Dick	Your online map of the sale area shows the location of cutting units. Units 5, 8,9,13, and 14 are adjacent and create a 127 acre clearcut. Please assure that your draft EA includes all the clearcut information required by NFMA	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Artley, Dick	Please assure the draft EA includes an aerial photo of the same area as the current online map. Table 2 indicates the 8 square mile analysis area contains zero acres of ESH. The photo will show the public that there are no openings.	<p>The effect of the proposed action and alternatives on the project area's age class distribution and species composition will be discussed in the EA (pages xxx and xxx).</p> <p>Although there is "fine scale ESH" in the project area (road corridors, small canopy gaps caused by individual tree falls), and while these small patches add diversity to the forested landscape, they are not large enough to contain high stem densities and other characteristics of larger patches of ESH. This is the reason that ESH acreage is tracked on the Forest in patches larger than 2 acres (Forest Plan, page xx).</p>
Artley, Dick	building 1.7 miles of sediment causing road. Please add this to your draft EA	<p>The effect of the eventual loss of hemlock on the project area will be discussed in the EA (page xx).</p> <p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Aschmeyer, Jim	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Aspinwall, Anne	<p>Please save the mature trees. You have an option to remove younger trees to reach the same purpose of providing the habitat. SAVE OUR MATURE TREES.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bailey, Donald	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Banks, Jerry	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Barnard, Carol	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bass, Kenneth	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bauer, Melissa	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Baumgartner, Bryce	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Bearden, Jerry	am writing you to express my support for the Fighting Town Creek Wildlife Habitat Project. Our National Forests are so in need of some timber management and harvests to help stop the drastic decline of early successional wildlife species such as the Ruffed Grouse, American Woodcock and some neo-tropical migrant songbirds (such as the Blue Winged Warbler, Chestnut-sided Warbler and Prairie Warbler).	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Beavers, Bill	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Biagi, David	Protect Georgia sent me information you plan to clear cut many acres of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project, instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Blankenship, Kim	I am very concerned that your proposed cutting in this area. The reasoning of this project is bogus and as researched shows no benefit to Wildlife	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p> <p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>
Blankenship, Kim	and will contribute to erosion problems	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Blubaugh, Michael	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Boddie, Nathan	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bowden, Dan	<p>The size of the project seems very large and seems to consist of removing lots of large oaks and poplars 70 to 90 years old. It was my understanding when this area was cut previously that we wanted to restore the area to more natural stands, which seems to be happening. I understand the need for early successional forest for grouse and song birds but cutting large trees in such large numbers seems more like a timber sale. As you know we all have spent years trying to recover from the large timber sales of 30 years ago. Large numbers of clear cuts, new class c roads built and existing forest roads improved and maintained at our expense</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p>
		<p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p>
Bowden, Dan		<p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p>
		<p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="1287 1076 1969 1287">1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use. <li data-bbox="1287 1287 1969 1351">2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>After the timber sale many of these roads were not gated or closed properly and were used by off road vehicles to access USFS and private property illegally. A few years ago many of these illegal roads were finally closed after years of frustration, time and money spent by the USFS and private owners. Once again the budget is being cut for law enforcement, and I am concerned about how and when new roads will be closed after the project is completed to prevent some of problems we have had in the past with off road vehicles.</p> <p>Who will benefit financially from the sale, and if the cost to improve or build roads will be offset from said profits from the sale of the lumber?</p>	<p>the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks. 4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller "feeder" or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA. 5. The user created trail into the Devil's Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns. 6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bowden, Dan	<p>The large proposed treatment areas off USFS Rd 798 in 005, 008, 009, 0013, 0014, 0022, seem excessive. Area 0014 off USFS Rd 798 comes to the top of the ridge causing a view problem and needs stop further down the slope to the north east.</p>	<p>7. Comments noted.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use. 2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA. 3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks. 4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bowden, Dan	I will need to visit McClure Creek in compartment 680 # 039 off USFS Rd 796 to determine possible issues with sediment into McClure Creek.	<p>resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller “feeder” or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. The user created trail into the Devil’s Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns. 6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources. 7. Comments noted. <p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bowen, Barbara	<p>As a bird watcher and wildlife photographer, I am an advocate of habitat improvement for any living creature. However, the plan to "Clearcut" 437 Acres in the Fightingtown Creek Watershed in Fannin County would be detrimental to many species who are currently thriving in the forest but also for the Ruffed Grouse. Per the DNR website http://georgiawildlife.com/node/136, the Ruffed Grouse prefer early staged forest but also need some larger mast trees for protection and foraging. It would stand to reason that selective cutting to allow some of the Large Mast Oak trees to remain would provide a more suitable habitat but also allow the new growth needed for the Ruffed Grouse to forage. Please consider altering the current plan from a "clear-cut" to a "selective cut" in order to offer a better more suitable habit for our current wildlife and the struggling Ruffed Grouse. Thank you for your time.</p>	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bowler, Leslee	Please do not cut healthy, mature forests as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project when young, degraded stands are available to be cut for wildlife habitats. Our mature forests are a very important part of our state and we must protect them.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Box, Craig	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bratcher, Linda	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Bugge, John	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Busby, Mary Jo	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Callison, Jim	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Candalino, Joan	<p>Please choose no to cutting these areas. Please choose to protect them and to manage them as old growth areas.</p> <p>There is plenty of early success wildlife habitat on private lands, usage of forest service lands must consider the usage of surrounding private lands in considering what is available for wildlife. There is little of private lands managed as old growth areas. There is a great need for management of forest service lands as old growth. It makes no sense to choose early successional habitat to manage as old growth areas when older growth areas are available. It makes sense to manage older forests for old growth areas and To Continue To So Designate Them In Subsequent Plans.</p>	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Carr, Gail	<p>This project is ill conceived and should be considered for another area that is not old growth.</p> <p>According to the Forest Service's own data 13 of those 17 stands are over 75 years old, and three are over 100 years old. This project would involve cutting towering stands of oaks and tuliptrees.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p>
Carr, Gail	<p>The project involves several stands with large areas of steep slopes, well in excess of the limit in Georgia forestry best management practices. The road accessing those stands suffered a landslide in the early 1990's.</p>	<p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Carr, Gail	Plus, those stands have regenerated in less diverse forest that provides low quality wildlife habitat.	There is a abundance of late-successional forest (stands over 80 years old) in the project area (and across the larger landscape) which provides habitat for a wide variety of plants and animals. Not all species occur in the same ecological niche, however, and there are many species that utilize young forests for some of their life stages or seasons. This fact is reflected in the Land and Resource Management Plan for the Chattahoochee-Oconee National Forests; it contains objectives to create and/or maintain a range of forest successional stages in order to provide for the needs of area wildlife, including those that are disturbance-dependent. Management Prescription 9.H contains a target range of early successional stage forest (4-10% of the prescription area) in order to provide habitat for species that require this type of habitat.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Carson, Mark	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Carter, Jack	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Cater, Linda	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Cheairs, Ross	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Clayton, Deborah	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Cline, Margie	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Cobb-Morris, Kimberley	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Coffin, Tom	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Coogle, Sharon	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Cottell, Duncan	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Cowie, Ian	As I understand, the project involves the cutting of old mature trees. Why is this necessary when less aged trees could serve the same purpose? I have seen areas in the forest where replacement stands provide low quality wildlife habitat. I would think the goal of the new habitat should be more diversity rather than less.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Cowie, Ian	Another concern is working in stands with steep slopes. Where is the use of best management practices? I fear more damage could result through soil erosion - not just in the immediate area but also downstream.	<p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Cromeans, Theresa	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Crouse, Gray	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Davis, Robert	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Davis, Robin	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Davison, Heidi	<p>I also understand the concept of thinning either through cutting or controlled burns as a way of sustaining a healthy forest. But, I don't understand cutting mature, healthy trees, some 75-years old, over young and degraded trees that provide a poor quality habitat due to reduced diversity for the very birds we hope to help and protect.</p> <p>Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Debavadi, Carolyn	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
DeLoach, Patsy	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Demonbreun-Chapman, Jesse	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Dixon, Jr, Forrest	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Dockery, Terry	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Ellicott, Tom	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Ellinger, Lesleigh	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Ellington, Jeannie	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Emmons, Carol	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Engbritson, David	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Enriquez, Mario	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Fleet, Gary	<p>Thank you for your diligent research in the study of the project for the vegetation management in the Fightingtown Creek drainage area. It is my sincere hope that you go through with this project. Young forest development is essential to a diverse wildlife habitat and without it the number of birds, animals, and native plants in an area will decrease. I have walked through areas of forest that are primarily old growth and there is a noticeable lack of wildlife as well as a diversity of plant life. When there is cutting done to develop a young forest habitat there is almost an immediate response of wildlife to the new growth that comes in the newly cut area. This project will be a benefit to hunters, wildlife, and nature viewers altogether. It will also be a plus for the land as it will promote a healthy forest.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
Fleet, Judith	<p>I am glad to have the opportunity to comment on the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat project. When a forest does not have proper management or is naturally not restored to an condition where there is young growth it is not good for the plant life or wildlife. I certainly understand the beauty of old trees and do enjoy seeing and preserving them. However, there is a need for new growth as an old growth forest just cannot sustainably support wildlife and native plant life. Songbirds, foxes, grouse, deer, turkeys, bears, and all other sorts of wildlife will benefit greatly from this young forest initiative that you are considering. Please do not delay going ahead with this project any longer and all parties involved will see the benefits of proper forest management. Thank you.</p>	Thank you for your comments.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Flowers, Robert	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Fogel, Ken	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Followill, Peter	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Fowler, Donald	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Fox, Catherine	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. Of course!	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Frank, Karen	I am surprised that you would consider cutting these older established trees. Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Frankel, Jeffrey	recommend instead that the Forest Service cut younger stands and manage restoration for the same purpose: providing habitat for declining bird species.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Frankel, Jeffrey	I have read some of the issues with this proposed cutting: some of the cutting would occur in areas with steep slopes, resulting in potential severe erosion	The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Freeman, Carrie	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. Habitat belongs to those who live there (wildlife) not humans for lumber.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Galland, Max	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Garmon, T	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. DON'T CUT ANY TREES..... NATURE IS MUCH BETTER THAN YOU PEOPLE WILL EVER BE. PROTECT...NOT DESTROY !!! DO THE RIGHT THING FOR NATURE AND FOR US.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Garrard, Ellen	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Garrett, Beth	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Geller, Eddie	<p>This just makes absolutely no sense to me. Cut trees down to make it better for a bird. Yet make it worse for deer, bear, turkey and the smaller animals and birds</p>	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Geller, Eddie	<p>The forest are off limits to ATV and UTV traffic because they leave ruts and cause erosion. I guess logging won't cause erosion? Yea right. I have seen personal lands logged and the after effects were pretty bad.</p> <p>I guess with the erosion It won't effect Fightingtown Creek which is a natural trout stream.</p> <p>Yea right. Opening up the canopy above Fightingtown Creek will effect the water temperature which will effect the trout in a wrong way.</p> <p>The whole ecosystem will be effected.</p>	<p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>
George, Walter	<p>Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. I live in Fannin County and am familiar with the area that is proposed to be clear cut. While enhancing wildlife habitat is an important goal, I see no need to cut these magnificent trees to accomplish that goal. Nearby are marginal forest lands that could be cut. Please reconsider your plan.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Gibson, Estelle	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Gilchrist, S.M.	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Goldberg, James	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Golden, Kathleen	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Goodson, Jonathan	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Gordon, Judith	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Griffith, Eric	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Griffith, Peg	Also, if the intended outcome is to restore habitat for grouse, do you intend to work with DNR to "stock" appropriate habitat with several flocks of grouse?	<p>Predation and other environmental factors (weather and climate) are certainly important causes of ruffed grouse decline. These factors are closely linked to the importance of suitable habitat and the close juxtaposition of quality habitat components such as mature mast producing oaks, lush herbaceous groundcover for brood rearing, and dense patches with high stem density for breeding and escape cover.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Griffith, Peg	Please make a note that I am firmly opposed to the proposed cut in the Fightingtown area. The FS's own data notes that these were stand of 75 - 100 year old trees! If the FS must cut, please thin pine, or cut younger trees (under 35 years or so.)	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Haber, Martin	viable alternative would be to cut young, degraded stands in the same area and manage for restoration in order to meet the goals of this wildlife habitat project.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Haber, Martin	<p>1-Thirteen of the seventeen stands that are identified to be cut for this project are over 75 years old and three are over 100 years old. Forest stands of this maturity are a great resource as they are for many reasons and should be preserved for the public's use and enjoyment as well as for their ecological value.</p>	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old. This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Haber, Martin	2-Several of the stand involved in this project are large areas with steep slopes, all in excess of the limit in Georgia forest best management practices.	The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.
Haley, Nedom	<p>Please be conservative in deciding what to clearcut as what is done today will have an effect for many generations yet to come.</p> <p>What information is available indicates that what is proposed may have unintended consequences to wildlife habitat</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hall, Dinorah	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hallen, Michael	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hamburger, Nancy	<p>I'm writing to state my opposition to the proposed cutting of 80 to 90% of the canopy across 17 stands totaling 436 acres.</p> <p>The value of the trees far outweighs benefits to bird population.</p> <p>Please, please do not cut down the trees. Let them remain for future generations.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hamilton, John	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Hammond, Adam	Please accept our comments for full support of this project. We are particularly excited to see the creation/maintenance of ESH in this area - 484 acres, which as you've noted, will be beneficial to a number of wildlife species.	Thank you for your comments.
Hammond, Adam	We would encourage you to incorporate additional acres of forest management, primarily thinning, and/or the use of prescribed fire in this area, wherever appropriate.	Thank you for your comments.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hanley, Jamie	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>
Hanthorn, Joshua	Further, the project includes several stands on steep slopes. These slopes are well in excess of the limit set forth in Georgia forestry best management practices. The road accessing those stands suffered a landslide in the early 1990's. Since the 1990's, several cabins have been built in the area and a landslide now would cause major property damage	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hanthorn, Joshua	The Georgia Chapter of the Sierra Club urges you to not cut any mature Oaks as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project.	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>
Hanthorn, Joshua	This project would jeopardize Georgia's most famous trout stream	Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hanthorn, Joshua	<p>Fortunately the creek survived the last road development more than a decade ago, to become one of Georgia's most thriving ecological and recreational landscapes. Most areas of the stream are wadeable, making it very popular for kayaking, rafting, and canoeing. The creek, particularly famous for its brown and rainbow trout, is highly used for fly fishing in many places. The creek is also home to a number of endangered amphibians, like the Northern Cricket Frog and the American Toad.</p>	<p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>
Hanthorn, Joshua	<p>The proposed Fightingtown Creek Habitat Project includes cutting of over 300 acres of old growth stands that keep the watershed from flooding in the spring, when the area is frequently visited. The creek flows rapidly during the spring months when the area gets heavy rain, but almost never floods because the towering stands surrounding the creek act as water buffers. If these tall trees are cut this valuable watershed can be severally damaged</p>	<p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>
Hanthorn, Joshua	<p>one of Northern Georgia's most popular recreational areas</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use. 2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands

Author(s)	Comment	Response
		<p>will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks. 4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller "feeder" or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA. 5. The user created trail into the Devil's Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns. 6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources. 7. Comments noted.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Harmon, Sue	<p>I truly appreciate the opportunity to comment on the above project.</p> <p>I understand from Georgia Forestwatch that the current project plan will allow cutting of healthy, mature forest, often on steep slopes, when there are younger, degraded stands that can be managed for restoration</p> <p>/</p> <p>habitat for grouse and birds, if that is truly the goal. It appears that there is an unstated goal to remove large timber. Why else would you cut older growth stands on steep slopes when degraded stands requiring fewer roads (which we all know can likely cause erosion and are expensive to build and maintain) will do the the job of the stated goal?</p> <p>I would appreciate any response. I know these issues are complicated and not always what they seem on the surface.</p> <p>Thanks for taking time to hear my concerns.</p>	<p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Harmon, Sue	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Harrell, Carlotta	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Harris, DeAnna	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Harris, Robert	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hartline, Denise	Please, please, please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project! Cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hassell, Kristin	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hatcher, Bob & Margaret	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Heath, Janet	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hein, Inez	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Helton, Ann	I am apposed to the cutting of old growth trees in the Fightingtown Creek district	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Helton, Ann	I have been witness to the laying waste of the Forest Service cutting of old growth Forest.	<p data-bbox="1245 321 1980 475">Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p data-bbox="1245 508 1965 816">The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p data-bbox="1245 849 1948 1036">The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p data-bbox="1245 1068 1948 1279">Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Helton, Ann	Many plants and air quality will be damaged	The effects of the proposed action and alternatives on vegetation and climate will be analyzed and disclosed in the EA.
Helton, Ann	There will be erosion from water run off will polute our trout streams	Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.
Herrington, Mary	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hickson, Jo	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
Higginbotham, John	I am for the proposed timber harvest	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hill, A.D.	<p>These continued efforts to claim old growth forest is such a tired old effort to gut America of our diverse forest and sell it to the highest bidder. What a shame for the very serviceable forest rangers to be used for promotion of devious intent. Leave old growth forest be.</p>	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hill, Sandra	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hilpert, Susan	Hard to believe the forest service would choose to cut beautiful old growth stands of Liriodendron tulipifera rather than recut areas that have grown back with lower quality mixes of trees. Clear cutting may be cheaper than selective logging, and I suppose there is a market for those large tulip trees and oaks, but natural heritage will be lost. Bird hunting may be very important in Georgia and many other states, and habitat protection and/or creation can be important, but should never be accomplished by destroying what nature has taken generations to create	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Holland, Lewis	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hollison, Kay	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Holmberg, Mark	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p>
Holmberg, Mark	Watershed protection benefits wildlife and protects clean water	<p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Horton, Beverly	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Howell, Shepherd	<p>There seems to still be a great reliance on clear cutting. I would urge the Forest Service to limit that or phase it out completely in favor of thinning. A clear cut may create good early succesional habitat for a short while, but the "canopy" soon tops out and leaves little or no</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Howell, Shepherd	you will be doing a good bit of clear cutting in oak sites. do not favor that practice. Ifyou wish to create early succesional habitat I would prefer you do that in stands of pine and/or poplar. To me, it does not make sense to cut down mature oak trees on the theory that you are trying to create an oak forest. I believe we should keep and protect our oaks and hickories as much as possi ble and try to restore more of the forest to a mast producing component	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Howell, Shepherd	<p>H.B. Ayres and W.W. Ashe in their 1905 survey of the Southern Appalachian Forest for the Department of the Interior reported that the area in the Southern Appalachian Mountains , including the Smoky Mountains and the Little Tennessee Basin, had an average component of approximately 40 percent oak and 17 percent chestnut. The white pine less than 3 percent and hemlock was approximately 5 percent , and poplar was less than 2 percent. I am not sure that they surveyed the Cohutta Mountains but I believe their findings would be comparable to the Cohuttas. Today I believe that those percentages are way out of line as past timber harvest has favored early succesional species like pine, poplar and maple. By all accounts the early forest produced a great amount of game. I believe one primary reason was that almost 60 percent of the forest were mast bearing trees</p>	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Howell, Shepherd	<p>herbaceous plants on the forest floor where it would be available for deer and other animals. Thinning the forest Ibelieve more closely mimics the natural forest regeneration , and provides a greater diversity of habitat for a longer period of time.</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hubbard, Roy	<p>Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. I would question the reasons for disregarding the proposed more reasonable and less destructive idea of cutting the adjacent areas already altered by previous cutting. Perhaps it has something to do with the marketing of the virgin hardwood?</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hudson, Sigmund	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Humphrey, Michael	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hunsicker, Michelle	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hutchinson, Terry	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Hyslop, Linda	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Ingle, April	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Johnson, Eleanor	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. There are immature forests that can be adjusted to meet the needs of declining bird species.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Johnson, Eleanor	As a birder, and there are quite a few birders who live and who visit Fannin County, we ask that you protect the migrating birds who need the tall older forest by protecting older taller trees like Tulip popular and oaks.	There is a abundance of late-successional forest (stands over 80 years old) in the project area (and across the larger landscape) which provides habitat for a wide variety of plants and animals. Not all species occur in the same ecological niche, however, and there are many species that utilize young forests for some of their life stages or seasons. This fact is reflected in the Land and Resource Management Plan for the Chattahoochee-Oconee National Forests; it contains objectives to create and/or maintain a range of forest successional stages in order to provide for the needs of area wildlife, including those that are disturbance-dependent. Management Prescription 9.H contains a target range of early successional stage forest (4-10% of the prescription area) in order to provide habitat for species that require this type of habitat.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Johnson, Katharine	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Jones, Elliott	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Jones, Rebecca	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Karel, Kevin	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Keysar, Elizabeth	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Kirk, Nancy Jo	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Klemenich, Katie	Protect this valuable area for the next generation of Georgians. Avoid cutting healthy, mature forest. We need all our trees now, more than ever. Long Live Planet Earth.	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Lachapelle, Mike	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
LaFountain, Marc	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
LaFountain, Marc	Clear cutting forests, especially on steep slopes, is rarely ever an intelligent approach	<p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Lamb, William	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
LaPean, Sr, James	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Lasris, Mary	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Latour, Kathryn	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Leigh, Richard	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Leigh, Richard	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Liner, Tom	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Liverman, Ben	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Lloyd, Gayle	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Lowe, Roy and Patty	Please avoid cutting healthy mature forest. Instead cut degraded stands and manage for restoration. Thanks for opportunity to respond, Roy and Patty Lowe	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Lucas, Lewis	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Ludtke, Phil	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Luhn, Barbara	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. This move to support the healthy, mature forest is supported by respected wildlife groups in our state. Thank you.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Luther, Jeffrey	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p>
MacIntyre, Dan	Also, please be extremely careful with your silt wherever you cut. Fightingtown Creek is one of the favorite paddling rivers of the Georgia Canoeing Association. It is beautiful, clear and pristine. Please gove your best effort to keep it that way.	<p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
MacIntyre, Dan	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Magill, Robert	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Martin, Laura	Please do not cut ANY healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Martinez, Frank	<p>Please note I support the proposal as it stands, and support Ranger Gardner's efforts. Forest management, and it's impact on wildlife, is LONG overdue! Early Succession Habitat is integral to the plan, and the lack of it now in our forests is a cause for great concern. The future of our forests depend on well-reasoned management and stewardship</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Matthews, Emily	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Matturo, Bill	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
McBride, Scott	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
McIntosh, Peter	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. If you'd like to discuss this over a cocktail, I'll buy	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Meadors, Helen	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Mermin, Margaret	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Merritt, David	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Metzger, Vinnie	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Meyers, Kitty	ease do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Miceli, Bob and Karen	<p>My husband and I recently purchased land in the Cashes Valley area. We plan to build our retirement home and eventually leave this land as our legacy to our grandchildren. It is our hope that the area remains as pristine and lush as when we first fell in love with it. We are concerned about the "Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project." Past practices have shown that it would be better to avoid cutting healthy, mature forest, and instead cut the young and degraded stands for restoration. While we feel it is important to aid in the survival of the ruffed grouse and other bird species whose habitat is declining, not managing properly at this stage would result in loss of habitat that could not be undone.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Miller, Dale	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Miller, Dale	Protect our watersheds and surface waters while managing our total Natural Capital!	Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Miller, Phyllis	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Miller, Ross	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Minick, Diane	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Minick, Diane	Removing these trees will not only cause the streams to warm, killing/changing the biota, the loss of those trees will also cause significant erosion which will negatively impact streams through sedimentation and affect the productivity of the forest area due to soil loss which will cause an entire watershed to be negatively impacted and loss of habitat for species currently enjoying an old growth environment. Another negative is the loss of significant transpiration of groundwater to air connection, a critical part of the water cycle.	Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Moody, Michael	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Moody, Michael	The forest service has clear cut so many parcels of land in the recent and immediate past, there's no justification in clear cutting a steep hardwood forest. It's a travesty.	<p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Morneault, Kenneth	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Morrow, Wendy	Please do not clear cut healthy mature forests, which already provide very good quality wildlife habitat. Habitat for the grouse could be achieved by cutting young degraded stands that make up less diverse forest areas resulting from clear cuts of years past	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Morrow, Wendy	Please do not clear cut healthy mature forests, which already provide very good quality wildlife habitat. Habitat for the grouse could be achieved by cutting young degraded stands that make up less diverse forest areas resulting from clear cuts of years past. Thank you for taking this into your consideration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Moss, Mikasa	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Mraz, Brian	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Newell, Barbara	<p>This is "old growth" forest of oak and tulip poplar trees that are mature and healthy. You have an alternative and I ask you to choose that one: the cutting of young and degraded stands. I realize that your stated reason is providing habitat for declining ruffed grouse. You can do this by other means. I know that you know that I know the old growth cut is about the "almighty bottom dollar" that drives most poor unhealthy decisions</p>	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Newton, Patricia	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Nixon, Georgette	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Noakes, Robert	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Nobles, Marilyn	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Norris, Bill & Cheryl	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Nott, Roger	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p>
Nott, Roger	I have canoed Fightingtown Creek many times and know first hand how beautiful it is and how important it is to protect its headwaters	<p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Ohrstrom, Keith	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Olson, Sherry	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
O'Mara, Paul	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Ordiway, Linda	This proposed project is an excellent example of recognizing the issues surrounding the lack of forest management and actively pursuing a means to fulfill the USFS obligation to increase habitat diversity for wildlife and the benefit to all forest users. As you state, there is ample evidence of the effects of loss of habitat diversity regarding wildlife populations.	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Ordiway, Linda		Thank you for your comments.
	The distribution and position of the suggested regeneration cuts is critical in achieving the optimal habitat effects from management. The proposed location of the timber management areas meets these needs.	
Ordiway, Linda		The provision of a well-distributed and representative network of large, medium, and small potential old growth blocks is an important goal of the Forest Plan, and there are specific objectives and standards related to the designation of a certain percentage of each watershed (sixth level HUC unit) (Forest Plan pgs. 2-16-18). Incremental progress toward the designation of 5% of each watershed must be made at the project level.
	I would caution the designation of areas as old growth which retards the ability to utilize harvesting if faced with future forest health or natural disturbance issues	Timber may be salvaged after a catastrophe as needed, and native pests may be controlled under some conditions depending on the resource values at risk (Forest Plan pg. 3-107-108).

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Osier, Mary	Please do not cut any mature oaks in this project. It will deplete feed for wildlife in the area	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Pagenkopf, Kris	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Pagenkopf, Kris	<p>I understand that the Forest Service has proposed cutting 80 to 90% of the canopy across 17 stands totaling 436 acres. While the stated purpose of the cutting is to provide habitat for ruffed grouse and other declining bird species associated with very young forest.</p> <p>But looking at adjacent stands the Forest Service clear-cut 20, 30, 40 years ago, those stands have regenerated in less diverse forest that provides low quality wildlife habitat</p> <p>As you know, 13 of those 17 stands are over 75 years old, and three are over 100 years old. This project would involve cutting towering stands of oaks and tuliptrees. The proposed project also involves several stands with large areas of steep slopes, well in excess of the limit in Georgia forestry best management practices. The road accessing those stands suffered a landslide in the early 1990's</p> <p>To help protect this valuable area for the next generation of Georgians, I ask you to avoid cutting healthy, mature forest, and to instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.</p>	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Parkerson, Phil	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Pauli, Sharon	<p>Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. We are losing mature forest daily through nature. Please don't accelerate this loss when it isn't necessary</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Peret, Eunicia	<p>pretext of saving some small ruffed grouse or other bird species. Please think about what deforestation of those mature trees will do to the next generation, other larger species of animals that may be much more impacted by the cutting of those trees</p>	<p>There is a abundance of late-successional forest (stands over 80 years old) in the project area (and across the larger landscape) which provides habitat for a wide variety of plants and animals. Not all species occur in the same ecological niche, however, and there are many species that utilize young forests for some of their life stages or seasons. This fact is reflected in the Land and Resource Management Plan for the Chattahoochee-Oconee National Forests; it contains objectives to create and/or maintain a range of forest successional stages in order to provide for the needs of area wildlife, including those that are disturbance-dependent. Management Prescription 9.H contains a target range of early successional stage forest (4-10% of the prescription area) in order to provide habitat for species that require this type of habitat.</p>
Peret, Eunicia	<p>et's stop spending money on projects that do now add true value to us or the environment and instead focus on improving the forest roads, keeping littering to a minimum, minimizing off-roading activity, all of which ultimately impact the natural species in a much more negative way than well grown trees....</p>	<p>Comment noted.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Peters, Lydia	Please do not cut down a mature canopy of trees that provides much-needed biodiversity. Surely you can find younger stands of trees to cut to provide a habitat for the ruffed grouse and other declining bird species. The destruction of the Fightingtown Creek area would have far-reaching consequences, none of them positive.	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Platt, Audrey	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Plousis, Drew	Please avoid cutting healthy mature forest and cut young degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Poole, Robin	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Portwood, Tommy	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Powers, Joe	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Price, Jonathan	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Purvis, James	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Reardon, Michael	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Reeves, Corinne	Please avoid cutting healthy, mature forests as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project, instead, consider cutting young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Reynolds, Beverly	<p>It is with regret that I have been informed of the Forest Service's decision to clear-cut a mature forest for purpose of saving grouse and other bird species habitat. Perhaps a younger forest that has already been clear-cut in recent years could be a better solution.</p> <p>Please preserve our mature growth forests. These are priceless and irreplaceable.</p> <p>Thank you for your consideration.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Rhangos, Eleanor	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Riddle, Jess	We are pleased to see the District managing for wildlife species that may face population viability issues in coming decades. However, we have some concerns about the tactics used to manage for those species, and we would like to share our observations.	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>
Riddle, Jess	Harvesting on steep slopes presents erosion and sedimentation risks and may violate NFMA	<p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>To comply with NEPA and the National Forest Management Act (NFMA), the District must provide project-specific information or insight into the risks of erosion, sedimentation of streams and soil productivity loss. Here, we believe those risks are significant. As the scoping notice mentions, much of the project area lies on steep slopes that present an inherent erosion and sedimentation risk. ESH treatments are slated for several stands with slopes that exceed steepness limits in Georgia's Best Management Practices for Forestry. These steep slopes extend across extensive areas and cannot be avoided in some stands (see appendix 1). Our concerns about these stands are not merely theoretical. Forest Service road 792, which provides access to 10 of the 17 stands including the steepest ones, suffered a landslide in the early 1990s. To sufficiently protect soil and water resources, many of these stands should be dropped from the project. At the very least, harvesting should be avoided in stands with extensive areas over 35% slope.</p> <p>NFMA requires the Forest Service to "insure" that timber is harvested only where "soil, slope, or other watershed conditions will not be irreversibly damaged" 16 U.S.C. § 1604(g)(3)(E)(i). The agency also must "insure research on and (based on continuous monitoring and assessment in the field) evaluation of the effects of each management system to the end that it will not produce substantial and permanent impairment of the productivity of the land." § 1604(g)(3)(C). Courts have confirmed that the NFMA productivity requirement applies to soil productivity⁵. The agency must assess and disclose its ability to comply with those requirements given the intensity of harvest on soils with high erosion potential, on steep slopes, and in an area with</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>high annual rainfall. That assessment must be based on "high quality" information and "accurate scientific analysis" specific to the soil/slope conditions in the project area. 40 C.F.R. § 1500.1(b).</p> <p>If the agency chooses to move forward with this project, the EA must discuss how the agency plans to mitigate soil, erosion, and sedimentation risks (among others) as required by NEPA6. Perfunctory descriptions of mitigating measures, without sufficient detail to ensure that environmental consequences have been fairly evaluated, are inconsistent with the "hard look" required under NEPA7. Moreover, the agency should disclose what monitoring of erosion and sedimentation will be completed post-harvest.</p>	<p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>Management Prescription 9.H, which covers 90% of the project area, "[e]mphasizes management, maintenance, and restoration of plant associations to their ecological potential." Scoping Letter, Table 1. When visiting a stand in which the forest's ecological potential has been restored, most people would expect to see large, tall, old trees. It is true that Objective OBJ- 9-H-01 suggests that forest management should "maintain ... a minimum of 20 percent of forested acres in late successional forest," i.e. at least 80 years old. But for most hardwoods 80 years old is barely middle-aged, and such trees have not even reached their maximum mast production. With only 5% reserved for old growth, a visitor would be hard pressed to find the small areas in which the forest has achieved or is approaching what would be expected to be its ecological potential.</p>	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>Of particular concern is the impact of creating early successional habitat (ESH) in several select stands. We recognize that many species benefit from ESH and that the project area does not currently have the 4-10% of ESH suggested for Prescription 9.H in the Forest Plan. The Fightingtown Creek project proposes to address this deficiency by creating 436 acres of ESH (9.5% of the 9.H area). But creating more than 9% ESH per decade will have impacts beyond meeting the Forest Plan standard for ESH; it will significantly change the age distribution of the forest over the long-term. The agency must assess how the project will impact other age classes, and how changes in age distribution will affect the ecological dynamics of the forest, including species composition. As proposed, the project appears to trade a short-term gain (additional ESH and structural diversity) for a long-term loss (further degradation of forest composition, pattern, ecological processes, and long-term structural diversity).</p>	<p>The effect of the proposed action and alternatives on the project area's age class distribution and species composition will be discussed in the EA (pages xxx and xxx).</p> <p>Although there is "fine scale ESH" in the project area (road corridors, small canopy gaps caused by individual tree falls), and while these small patches add diversity to the forested landscape, they are not large enough to contain high stem densities and other characteristics of larger patches of ESH. This is the reason that ESH acreage is tracked on the Forest in patches larger than 2 acres (Forest Plan, page xx).</p> <p>The effect of the eventual loss of hemlock on the project area will be discussed in the EA (page xx).</p>
Riddle, Jess		<p>The Proposed Action includes an even-aged regeneration method to create early-successional habitat in mesic hardwood stands dominated by yellow poplar and in white pine-dominated stands. The Agency fully expects that these areas will regenerate to mesic hardwoods dominated by yellow poplar or to white pine in white pine-dominated parent stands.</p> <p>The Agency acknowledges that previously harvested oak stands in the project area contain proportionately more yellow poplar and fewer oaks than what existed prior to those harvests. The ability of oak to compete with yellow poplar on productive sites during regeneration is well documented in the</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>The scoping notice claims that "stands [identified for harvest] are dominated by mesic deciduous hardwoods or white pine (Pinus strobus) and would likely regenerate to the same species." This statement is belied by the current composition of the numerous recovering clearcuts in the area. While it is not hard to find young white pine thickets in these stands, not a single one of them has regenerated to the former composition of hardwoods. This is in stark contrast to the composition of older stands that have been allowed to naturally develop, which are, for the most part, dominated by oak. Aside from forest composition, this divergence is most distressing for wildlife, because it results in a lack of mast in these younger, degraded stands.</p> <p>The impact of past agency harvests in this area is highly relevant to the purpose of this project and its environmental impacts must be disclosed in the EA.1 Given that the ESH treatment will produce light levels similar to those found in past clearcuts, it is unclear why the agency expects to obtain a different result this time.</p>	<p>literature and unfortunately well demonstrated on mesic sites throughout the oak biome. The reference to pine thickets void of hardwood regeneration is a curious comment, since most areas harvested during earlier management entries are in fact hardwood (yellow poplar) dominated (see C783 S10, C782 S07, and lower slopes of C80 S13 of the proposed action), and references to harvesting degraded hardwood stands are made by this commenter and others multiple times in their responses.</p> <p>This project includes the regeneration of cove hardwood stands dominated by yellow poplar or stands dominated by white pine, and was designed specifically to avoid stands where oak was a major component. In fact, in only three stands (99 acres) included in the Proposed Action does oak comprise more than 20 percent of the current stocking. It is highly likely, if not inevitable, that these three stands will regenerate to a composition in which oak is less abundant than in the parent stand. The reduction of oak on these acres is insignificant, considering the abundance of oak within the project area where no treatments are proposed, and miniscule, when the distribution of oak across the forest is considered (46 percent of the Chattahoochee National Forest).</p> <p>The purpose of this project is not to regenerate oak, but to create young forest habitat, which is lacking on the Forest and a habitat in which many declining species depend. The Agency has developed an alternative to the proposed action which is more sensitive to the loss of oak as a mast producer and to address oak regeneration concerns. See EA for details of this alternative. The effects of the project alternatives on forest composition is given in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>The agency should avoid creating ESH in older stands, with more diverse species that provide important sources of mast for wildlife, and to the extent ESH is desired, focus management on degraded stands (i.e., stands that received heavy cutting in the past and lack compositional and structural diversity). Treatments which simultaneously create ESH and restore previously degraded stands better meet the goals of Prescription 9.H and this project.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p>
Riddle, Jess	<p>Creation of ESH from late- or even mid-successional stands will further degrade the forest's ecological potential and would be contrary to the purpose of 9.H: "restoration of historical plant associations and their ecological dynamics." The only way to avoid such degradation is to create ESH totally or primarily from stands currently in the seedling/sapling stage.</p>	<p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>This project includes management activities to create early-successional forest habitats. A total of 436 acres of even-aged regeneration harvests would be implemented to create this habitat condition. All harvests would occur within Management Prescription (MRx) 9.H, where management activities should be directed towards the restoration of declining communities, among other emphasis. Activities within this MRx should also emphasize the maintenance of suitable to optimal habitats to support populations of the plant and animal species associated with these communities.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
		<p>Survey information from across the Southern Appalachian region indicate that bird species dependent on early successional habitats have been on a steady decline due to the lack suitable habitats. Early successional forest habitats are infrequent on the Chattahoochee National Forest, and acutely scarce on mesic hardwood sites across the Forest. The proposed action was developed to address the infrequency of this habitat condition on the National Forest and to improve habitats for declining species.</p> <p>It is worth noting that MRx 9.H encompasses over 137,000 acres within the Blue Ridge and Upper Piedmont ecoregions of the Chattahoochee National Forest. Proposed treatments to create early-successional habitats on 436 acres could hardly be characterized as significant at this scale or even at the scale of the analysis area .</p> <p>The Forest Plan also clearly states that restoration within MRx 9.H should be evaluated at the landscape scale, and not at the stand level. When evaluated at the correct scale, the creation of early successional habitat on 436 acres is not degrading the ecological potential within the landscape, but is enhancing its diversity and restoring habitats that are infrequent and necessary for the maintenance of declining bird species. Accordingly, the proposed action is not contradictory to direction for MRx 9.H, but rather is implementing a primary focus for the prescription area - the maintenance of a habitat that is infrequent on the National Forest for which declining species within the project depend.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	we have difficulty understanding how harvesting healthy, older forest communities can be construed as restoring, maintaining, or improving them. Moreover, replacing older stands with younger stands disrupts the forest's ability to create sufficient levels of ESH in the future because younger stands are less susceptible to the forces that naturally result in ESH	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>
Riddle, Jess	significant projects in the 9.H Prescription such as this one should have a significant ecological restoration focus	This project includes management activities to create early-successional forest habitats. A total of 436 acres of even-aged

Author(s)	Comment	Response
		<p>regeneration harvests would be implemented to create this habitat condition. All harvests would occur within Management Prescription (MRx) 9.H, where management activities should be directed towards the restoration of declining communities, among other emphasis. Activities within this MRx should also emphasize the maintenance of suitable to optimal habitats to support populations of the plant and animal species associated with these communities.</p> <p>Survey information from across the Southern Appalachian region indicate that bird species dependent on early successional habitats have been on a steady decline due to the lack suitable habitats. Early successional forest habitats are infrequent on the Chattahoochee National Forest, and acutely scarce on mesic hardwood sites across the Forest. The proposed action was developed to address the infrequency of this habitat condition on the National Forest and to improve habitats for declining species.</p> <p>It is worth noting that MRx 9.H encompasses over 137,000 acres within the Blue Ridge and Upper Piedmont ecoregions of the Chattahoochee National Forest. Proposed treatments to create early-successional habitats on 436 acres could hardly be characterized as significant at this scale or even at the scale of the analysis area .</p> <p>The Forest Plan also clearly states that restoration within MRx 9.H should be evaluated at the landscape scale, and not at the stand level. When evaluated at the correct scale, the creation of early successional habitat on 436 acres is not degrading the ecological potential within the landscape, but is enhancing its diversity and restoring habitats that are infrequent and necessary for the maintenance of declining bird species. Accordingly, the proposed action is not contradictory to</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>Whether a project is "ecological restoration" must be evaluated using the agency's definition of ecological restoration:</p> <p>The process of assisting the recovery of an ecosystem that has been degraded, damaged, or destroyed. Ecological restoration focuses on reestablishing the composition, structure, pattern, and ecological processes necessary to facilitate terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems sustainability, resilience, and health under current and future conditions.</p> <p>36 C.F.R. §219.19. To unpack this definition, the agency should consider its own information on restoration, and other reputable scientific authorities defining and establishing best practices for ecological restoration.² Collectively, these resources should guide projects in the 9.H Prescription.</p> <p>At the same time, we recognize that the agency is not strictly limited to "restoration" treatments in the 9.H prescription. But implementing projects that cause further degradation turns the prescription on its head and must be avoided. Unfortunately, that is exactly what aspects of this project would do.</p>	<p>direction for MRx 9.H, but rather is implementing a primary focus for the prescription area - the maintenance of a habitat that is infrequent on the National Forest for which declining species within the project depend.</p> <p>This project includes management activities to create early-successional forest habitats. A total of 436 acres of even-aged regeneration harvests would be implemented to create this habitat condition. All harvests would occur within Management Prescription (MRx) 9.H, where management activities should be directed towards the restoration of declining communities, among other emphasis. Activities within this MRx should also emphasize the maintenance of suitable to optimal habitats to support populations of the plant and animal species associated with these communities.</p> <p>Survey information from across the Southern Appalachian region indicate that bird species dependent on early successional habitats have been on a steady decline due to the lack suitable habitats. Early successional forest habitats are infrequent on the Chattahoochee National Forest, and acutely scarce on mesic hardwood sites across the Forest. The proposed action was developed to address the infrequency of this habitat condition on the National Forest and to improve habitats for declining species.</p> <p>It is worth noting that MRx 9.H encompasses over 137,000 acres within the Blue Ridge and Upper Piedmont ecoregions of the Chattahoochee National Forest. Proposed treatments to create early-successional habitats on 436 acres could hardly be characterized as significant at this scale or even at the scale of the analysis area .</p> <p>The Forest Plan also clearly states that restoration within MRx</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>We want to briefly address two forest health based arguments against the practice of cutting young stands rather than older stands for producing ESH. While both arguments contain an element of truth, they ignore important context that ultimately renders them invalid. The first argument is that cutting young forests will degrade them and make them more difficult to restore in the future. We do not dispute that cutting young forests will shift them more towards highly competitive early successional species, and make it more difficult to produce a diverse forest on the site for decades to come. However, cutting younger forests leaves less of the landscape in a degraded condition. If there is a young stand and an old healthy stand, cutting the young stand leaves one degraded stand and one healthy stand. Cutting the older stand for ESH leaves both</p> <p>2 DellaSala, DA, A Martin, R Spivak, T Schulke, B Bird, M Criley, C van Daalen, J Kreilick, R Brown, and G Aplet. 2003. A citizen's call for ecological forest restoration: forest restoration</p>	<p>9.H should be evaluated at the landscape scale, and not at the stand level. When evaluated at the correct scale, the creation of early successional habitat on 436 acres is not degrading the ecological potential within the landscape, but is enhancing its diversity and restoring habitats that are infrequent and necessary for the maintenance of declining bird species. Accordingly, the proposed action is not contradictory to direction for MRx 9.H, but rather is implementing a primary focus for the prescription area - the maintenance of a habitat that is infrequent on the National Forest for which declining species within the project depend.</p> <p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>principles and criteria. Ecological Restoration 21, 14-23.</p> <p>stands degraded, resulting in a larger proportion of forest in a low-quality wildlife habitat condition for many decades. Consequently, we believe that retaining the older stands will ultimately result in a healthier, more diverse forest with higher quality wildlife habitat.</p> <p>The second argument is that cutting younger stands will leave a gap in the age distribution of stands across the forest. Cutting all of the younger stands could leave a gap in the age distribution. However, the rate of cutting during the 1970's and 80's far exceeds the amount of harvesting for ESH today, and historically even-aged stands occupied a small proportion of the landscape. In other words, there are plenty of young stands to target without disrupting the age distribution of stands across the forest. Choosing young stands for ESH will have only a small impact on the amount of sapling and pole stands on the forest, and will not produce a gap in the age distribution.</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>ForestWatch has concerns about how harvesting mature stands will affect hard mast production. The importance of hard mast on the health and productivity of wildlife is universally recognized. Acorns in particular feed many species, and some of their populations rise and fall in accord with acorn production cycles. This issue is particularly acute today as the loss of the American chestnut in the last century has already significantly decreased mast production and mast consistency in the Southern Appalachians. The scientific literature has also thoroughly documented the scarcity of oak reproduction across much of the eastern United States.³</p> <p>In our visits to the project area, we found this regional phenomenon applies to the project area too; while mature oaks may be widespread, advance regeneration is consistently scarce.</p> <p>Hence, oaks will likely decline in this area over the coming decades, intensifying the effects of removing oaks as part of this project. Harvesting mature oak stands would then be sacrificing one group of declining species (those dependent on mast) for another (ESH associates). That choice seems especially odd when the whole goal of the project is to improve wildlife habitat, not hasten its deterioration. The Forest Service must assess how this project, in combination with general declines in mast production across the forest and in this area in particular, will impact wildlife species apart from ESH-dependent species</p>	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>ForestWatch does not dispute that there are no large blocks of ESH in the Fightingtown area or that many wildlife species benefit from ESH. However, the claim in the scoping notice that there is no ESH in the project area is simply not true. Storms, landslides, and other processes have created fine scale ESH throughout the project area. For many species, such as cerulean warbler (<i>Dendroica cerulea</i>), small areas of ESH surrounded by mature forest is precisely the form of ESH they need</p>	<p>The effect of the proposed action and alternatives on the project area's age class distribution and species composition will be discussed in the EA (pages xxx and xxx).</p> <p>Although there is "fine scale ESH" in the project area (road corridors, small canopy gaps caused by individual tree falls), and while these small patches add diversity to the forested landscape, they are not large enough to contain high stem densities and other characteristics of larger patches of ESH. This is the reason that ESH acreage is tracked on the Forest in patches larger than 2 acres (Forest Plan, page xx).</p> <p>The effect of the eventual loss of hemlock on the project area will be discussed in the EA (page xx).</p>
Riddle, Jess	Broad leaf tick seed (<i>Coreopsis latifolia</i>), a rare species	
Riddle, Jess	<p>that we noted flowering along the edge of FSR 792, often flowers in small openings, but would be out-competed by larger species in a larger area of ESH. We also noted fairly extensive areas of existing ESH along other parts of FSR 792. The agency must re-evaluate the amount of ESH in the project area to better gauge the need for additional ESH.</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	addition to the ESH that has already formed naturally, hemlock woolly adelgid will produce considerable ESH over the next decade. Some of this ESH will be as individual tree gaps where hemlock grows scattered amongst other species, but large areas of ESH will form where hemlock is a dominant species. Lower McClure Creek and lower Buck Creek in particular have large populations of hemlock. The impact of additional ESH creation in coming decades must be acknowledged in the project EA and assessed as part of the agency's cumulative impacts analysis. See 40 C.F.R. § 1508.7	<p>The effect of the proposed action and alternatives on the project area's age class distribution and species composition will be discussed in the EA (pages xxx and xxx).</p> <p>Although there is "fine scale ESH" in the project area (road corridors, small canopy gaps caused by individual tree falls), and while these small patches add diversity to the forested landscape, they are not large enough to contain high stem densities and other characteristics of larger patches of ESH. This is the reason that ESH acreage is tracked on the Forest in patches larger than 2 acres (Forest Plan, page xx).</p>
Riddle, Jess	Hence, if the forests in the project area are allowed to mature, they will produce ESH at a natural rate sufficient to sustain the species that evolved in this ecosystem.	<p>The effect of the eventual loss of hemlock on the project area will be discussed in the EA (page xx).</p> <p>The effect of the proposed action and alternatives on the project area's age class distribution and species composition will be discussed in the EA (pages xxx and xxx).</p> <p>Although there is "fine scale ESH" in the project area (road corridors, small canopy gaps caused by individual tree falls), and while these small patches add diversity to the forested landscape, they are not large enough to contain high stem densities and other characteristics of larger patches of ESH. This is the reason that ESH acreage is tracked on the Forest in patches larger than 2 acres (Forest Plan, page xx).</p> <p>The effect of the eventual loss of hemlock on the project area will be discussed in the EA (page xx).</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>Inevitable ESH formation combined with the ESH treatments in this proposal will almost certainly leave over 10% of the project area as ESH. That situation indicates less active management is needed, and some stands should be dropped from the treatment. In choosing where to apply the treatment, effects on future ESH formation should be considered. Harvesting young stands for ESH has little effect on future ESH formation while harvesting mature stands will decrease naturally occurring ESH formation over the next century. The proposed treatment is unnecessary and ineffective if it furthers the problem it seeks to resolve</p>	<p>The effect of the proposed action and alternatives on the project area's age class distribution and species composition will be discussed in the EA (pages xxx and xxx).</p> <p>Although there is "fine scale ESH" in the project area (road corridors, small canopy gaps caused by individual tree falls), and while these small patches add diversity to the forested landscape, they are not large enough to contain high stem densities and other characteristics of larger patches of ESH. This is the reason that ESH acreage is tracked on the Forest in patches larger than 2 acres (Forest Plan, page xx).</p> <p>The effect of the eventual loss of hemlock on the project area will be discussed in the EA (page xx).</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	ESH treatments in Fightingtown should mirror the distribution of site indices in the watershed or be skewed towards lower site indices. However, the proposed treatments are significantly biased towards higher sites indices (t=4.48, p=0.0001). Many different factors limit flexibility in choosing stands for treatment, but any revision of the stands for treatment should consider including less productive stands	<p>The district has almost exclusively been creating early-successional forest habitats on lower productivity sites during the current planning cycle as a by-product of our shortleaf pine and longleaf pine restoration efforts. Very little or no early-successional habitat has been created on moderate to highly productive sites on the Conasauga Ranger District during the same time period.</p> <p>The Proposed Action would in fact improve the distribution of early-successional forest habitats on the district by creating up to 436 acres of this habitat on more productive sites in the project area.</p> <p>The project area is dominated by higher productivity sites due to prominent aspects and the elevations present within the area. Low productivity sites (Site Index 60 ft or lower) are only a minor component of the project area (less than 3 percent). Moderately productive sites (Site Index 70 - 80 ft) account for 60 percent of the project area acreage. Combined, moderately to higher productivity sites (Site Index > 80 ft) comprise nearly 98 percent of the project area. Logically then, the proposed action of creating early successional habitats is going to be skewed towards these higher productivity sites, because lower productivity sites are not available. It should also be noted that the moderately productive sites are most associated with oak forests, and this project purposely avoided oak-dominated stands for early-successional habitat creation. In addition, higher productivity sites contain abundant and diverse understory conditions, which are key habitat attributes for ruffed grouse, a ground-dwelling species.</p>
Riddle, Jess	we note and are encouraged that many of the stands are clustered near roads and accessing one stand will often help access adjacent stands.	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>It will be particularly important for the agency to assess the cumulative impact of clustering stands designated for ESH, most notably in upper McClure Creek. While clustering treatments has the benefit of leaving larger areas with intact cover for forest interior species, the larger treatment area may have a more significant impact on a particular watershed. Those impacts may be further exacerbated by the legacies of past disturbance. For instance, cutting during the 70s and 80s may have caused sediment deposition on stream beds, and harvesting now could expand that impact and significantly reduce the proportion of a stream without sedimentation issues. The environmental assessment for this project must consider both the cumulative impacts of clustering stands and the combined impact of current harvests and harvests during the 70s and 80s, which cover at least 18% of the watershed.</p>	<p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>It is additionally unclear if clustering ESH treatments complies with the Forest Plan. The NFMA mandates that "[r]esource plans and permits, contracts and other instruments for the use and occupancy of National Forest System lands shall be consistent with the land management plans." 16 U.S.C. § 1604(i). Therefore, all timber sales and other site-specific projects must be consistent with the Forest Plan. Sierra Club v. Martin, 168 F.3d 1, 4-5 (11th Cir. 1999). Forest Plan Standard FW-086 limits "maximum size of an opening created by even-aged or two-aged regeneration treatments [to] 40 acres." CONF Forest Plan, 2-25. Adjacent openings must be separated from each other by a minimum distance of 330 feet." FW-087, CONF Forest Plan, 2-25. It is unclear if the proposed clustering complies with this requirement.</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>The only species mentioned specifically in the scoping notice as requiring management activities is ruffed grouse. A multi-state study aimed at improving management of ruffed grouse in the central and southern Appalachians gathered data on population dynamics by radio-tagging over 3,000 grouse. They found that grouse reproduction was most sensitive to hard mast production and that predation, including avian and mammalian, was the leading cause of mortality⁸. We also note that grouse have recently been exposed to a novel predator (coyotes), and that Georgia represents the extreme southern edge of the species' range.</p>	<p>Predation and other environmental factors (weather and climate) are certainly important causes of ruffed grouse decline. These factors are closely linked to the importance of suitable habitat and the close juxtaposition of quality habitat components such as mature mast producing oaks, lush herbaceous groundcover for brood rearing, and dense patches with high stem density for breeding and escape cover.</p>
Riddle, Jess	<p>While a decrease in</p> <p>8 Devers, PK, DF Stauffer, GW Norman, DE Steffen, DM Whitaker, JD Sole, TJ Allen, SL Bittner, DA Buehler, JW Edwards, DE Figert, ST Friedhoff, WW Giuliano, CA Harper, WK Igo, RL Kirkpatrick, MH Seamster, HA Spiker Jr., DA Swanson, BC Tefft. 2007. Ruffed grouse population ecology in the Appalachian region. Wildlife Monographs 168, 1- 36.</p> <p>early successional habitat may contribute to the decline in grouse, some combination of predation, climate change, and other habitat change also likely plays a role</p>	<p>Predation and other environmental factors (weather and climate) are certainly important causes of ruffed grouse decline. These factors are closely linked to the importance of suitable habitat and the close juxtaposition of quality habitat components such as mature mast producing oaks, lush herbaceous groundcover for brood rearing, and dense patches with high stem density for breeding and escape cover.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>The scoping notice also states that breeding bird surveys from across the Eastern United States show that ESH dependent birds are declining. In fact, a wide variety of bird species, including some associated with common habitats, are in decline. Similar to grouse, other factors such as cat predation, communications towers, wind turbines, climate change, and habitat loss in both breeding and wintering areas likely contribute to the decline.</p>	
Riddle, Jess	<p>NEPA requires disclosure and consideration of different scientific views and other relevant information⁹. The environmental assessment should analyze the efficacy of the proposed treatments in the context of these other factors that may mitigate the effectiveness of treatments.</p>	<p>Comment noted.</p>
Riddle, Jess	<p>As the Forest service is aware the Cashes Valley/Fightingtown area has long been a center for illegal ATV activity. The amount of temporary roads either created or reopened needs to be carefully considered and kept to the absolute minimum. Special attention needs to be devoted to keeping ATVs off the temporary roads when they are open and particularly when they are closed. Closures need to consist of more than a berm, and should incorporate a good deal of downed trees. In addition to unauthorized ATV activity, there is an unofficial maintained horse trail leading through stands 683-001 and 683-010 up into the fragile Devils Den botanical area. Forest Plan Standard FW-127 prohibiting cross country horse travel has been suspended, so cross country horse travel is currently legal. However, making or maintaining an unofficial trail is not legal. This trail should be closed and signed</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use. 2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA. 3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away

Author(s)	Comment	Response
		<p>from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller "feeder" or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA. 5. The user created trail into the Devil's Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns. 6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources. 7. Comments noted.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>The lower section of FSR 796 (mile 0.0-2.21) is a prime candidate for further "right sizing" the road system and decommissioning that section should be considered in project alternatives. This section of the road has long-standing sedimentation problems, likely more severe than the upper section. According to the TAP the road has "high" risk values but only provides "low" level benefits. In other words, decommissioning the road will mitigate serious erosion, sedimentation, and safety risks while only nominally affecting user access. If the agency chooses not to decommission the road, the sedimentation and erosion problems with the road must be addressed.</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>Additionally, the TAR recommended that FSR 792 (ML 2) and FSR 798 (ML 1) retain their existing maintenance levels. These roads also only provide "low" level benefits and should also be considered for decommissioning or maintenance level downgrade. The agency should also assess whether the scheduled maintenance proposed as part of this project will cause the roads to exceed their prescribed maintenance levels and, if so, consider the implications for the</p> <p>11 If significant changes have been made to this document we request that the agency release the revised TAR as soon as possible. Any revisions to the TAR which impact roads in the project area must at least be released with the project's draft EA.</p> <p>12 Letter from The Wilderness Society and Southern Environmental Law Center to Tony Tooke, Peter Gaulke, and Pablo Cruz (June 12, 2015) regarding Transportation Analysis Reports for units in Region 8 - common issues and</p> <p>effort to "right size" the road system. Finally, the agency must disclose whether the proposed maintenance will cause the roads to exceed their annual maintenance cost as reflected in the TAP/TAR.</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>Gathering additional information and looking at more remote stands will be necessary to determine which stands meet or come closest to meeting old- growth criteria.</p> <p>Selecting stands based solely on the criteria for defining old-growth will likely not "provide a well-distributed and representative network" of old-growth stands. Existing old-growth on the forest is highly correlated with steep slopes, south to west aspects, and low site index. Including productive, mesic, low elevation stands, or those on gentle topography will likely require first breaking the project area into those categories, then applying the old-growth criteria to each category. For example, the productive mesic stands may not be as old or little disturbed as the steep xeric stands, but they should be the closest to old-growth of the productive mesic stands</p>	
Riddle, Jess	<p>We believe an alternative that focuses primarily on: 1) creating ESH in young stands on gentle topography, and 2) considers restoration treatments of other degraded stands could accomplish the purpose and need of the project while providing several advantages over the original proposal. Some stands included in the original proposal fit this approach; 680-009, 680- 013, 683-010, and 684-031 are all decent candidates for ESH creation for the reasons mentioned above. However, other stands need to be dropped from the project: 680-014, 680-039, 681-013, 681-015, 681-018, 682-004, 682-021, 683-001, and 684-015. Transitioning these stands to ESH degrades the forest rather than restores it. New stands could be added if necessary to obtain sufficient ESH. We have</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>several potential stands in mind for that ESH, but we have not had an opportunity yet to ground truth them with this alternative in mind. This alternative would look for opportunities to further right size the road system while implementing the findings of the TAP and adjusting old growth designation as outlined above.</p> <p>In lieu of additional ESH treatments, the alternative would apply restoration treatments, mainly thinning, to stands 680-005, 680-008, and 682-007. These treatments would shift species composition and structure back towards a healthier and more diverse mix that historically occupied these sites. These stands are in need of restoration, because repeated past harvests have significantly shifted the species composition towards highly competitive early successional trees. The thinnings would remove a third or less of the basal area and remove only early successional species that had regenerated in response to the most recent harvest. Thinnings targeting less disturbed stands or other trees within disturbed stands would not be restoration and would not contribute towards the goals of the 9.H prescription. Additionally, the thinnings must be implemented with the intention of moving the forest towards a self-sustaining condition and must comply with the agency's definition of ecological restoration and associated resources mentioned previously.</p> <p>By shifting harvests to young degraded stands, our alternative would increase the watershed's net wildlife habitat quality in both the short and long term. Mature stands would not be cut, so cavity trees, mast production, and other positive wildlife habitat characteristics would be increased in the short term. In the long term, those same stands would mature further and ESH-creating processes like canopy gap formation</p>	<p>The alternative offered by the Respondent does not meet the purpose and need for the project because it does not create early-successional habitat (ESH) in a desired spatial arrangement and is limited in scale (62 acres of ESH; 53 acres of variable thinning to create small gaps, and 46 acres of non-commercial thinning to improve oak composition). Additionally, because steep slopes, accessibility and other factors determine the layout of individual harvest units, the acres of proposal are often only a fraction (average of 70 percent) of the acres intended/or proposed for treatment. The Respondent's proposal includes the creation of early-successional habitat on 62 acres. Using average rates of layout to proposed acres of treatment (70 percent) , the proposal submitted by the Respondent would net 43 acres of ESH within an 11675 acre watershed dominated by late-successional forest. The small acreage of treatment makes this proposal economically impractical.</p> <p>An alternative to the Proposed Action has been developed which incorporates certain elements of the respondents proposed alternative. The newly developed alternative retains more overstory trees, gives preference to oaks for retention, addresses concerns about loss of mast and oak regeneration, and will provide a variety of habitat conditions for early and late-successional forest-dependent wildlife species. This Alternative is described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>would return to their historical levels. Thus, the need for future management would be reduced. At the same time, our alternative would produce ESH of the same quality as the original proposal. Reducing habitat quality losses while maintaining benefits would produce an overall greater benefit to wildlife.</p> <p>The original proposal aims to "increase wildlife habitat diversity" towards the goal of providing habitat "for the full range of native and other desired species". However, the proposal would produce only one kind of wildlife habitat. ESH exists on a continuum from the large patches produced by hurricanes and other catastrophic events to single tree fall gaps. Different wildlife species are adapted to use ESH at different scales. The thinning treatments in this alternative would increase habitat diversity and produce habitat for a broader range of species.</p> <p>By placing the canopy gaps in degraded stands, those treatments would simultaneously help to restore the stands. Hence, the canopy gap treatments help fulfill the overall objectives of</p> <p>the 9.H prescription. The alternative also better meets the prescription objective, because healthy stands remain healthy. By retaining mature stands with ecological processes that are beginning to return to their natural states, the number of acres in a degraded condition is minimized, and the project area as a whole is closer to its ecological potential.</p> <p>In the short term, our alternative may produce less ESH in the</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Riddle, Jess	<p>project area. However, when combined with existing, unmapped, fine scale ESH and ESH from impending hemlock woolly adelgid mortality, the original proposal leaves Fightingtown Creek with more than the desired 4-10% ESH. Hence, some reduction in ESH treatments is actually desirable. Our alternative involves less steep slope area, and fewer buffers would be needed between stands to keep individual treatments below 40 acres. Consequently, a larger proportion of the area we propose could actually be treated to produce ESH.</p>	<p>Individual stand comments</p> <p>680-005: This stand appears to have been cut twice. The second cut was roughly 50 years ago, and while it appears to have removed half or more of the basal area, it left a significant cohort of older hickories and oaks. The repeated cutting appears to have shifted the composition strongly towards tuliptree. A third cut would shift the stand further away from its historical composition, even if the retained basal area were in hickories and oaks, because some of those hard mast producing species would have to be cut to reach the target basal area and conditions would strongly favor regeneration of tuliptree, white pine, and red maple. Thinning the stand, taking mostly tuliptree and other increasingly abundant species, would leave more trees to produce cavities and generate hard mast, provide canopy gaps for species associated with an intermediate light environment, and foster hickory and oak recruitment. The net effect would be to produce a more structurally diverse stand and put the stand on a trajectory back towards its historical composition.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>680-8 : This stand generally resembles 680-005, but has less of an older cohort. Enough time has elapsed since the stand was last cut that it has more complex structure than most of the younger stands in the project area. This stand is another good candidate for thinning and beginning the process of restoration. Removing the majority of the canopy now would only reinforce the negative effects of previous harvests.</p> <p>680-9 : This stand is far younger than indicated by CISC. The lower slopes were clear-cut within the last approximately 25 years, and most of the trees were harvested from the upper portions about 40 years ago. The upper slopes appear fairly acidic, nutrient poor, and moderate to dry in moisture, yet they are dominated by a mixture of tuliptree, red maple, and white pine. The younger lower forest is dominated by Virginia pine, nearly pure in places. These stands are far departed from historical conditions, and of much lower quality than most stands in the project</p> <p>area. Producing ESH here would be effective while representing minimal losses to existing resources.</p> <p>680-13 : This stand resembles the lower parts of 680-009 with dense areas of young Virginia pine and other early successional trees. Using this stand for ESH treatments could address watershed needs with minimal ecological cost.</p> <p>680-14 : Unlike most stands on gentle slopes in the watershed, this stand is in good condition. White oak and tuliptree dominate, but several other species including scarlet oak, white pine, sassafras, and red hickory are also present in the overstory. Without intervention, fungal decay and wind</p>	<p>The alternative offered by the Respondent does not meet the purpose and need for the project because it does not create early-successional habitat (ESH) in a desired spatial arrangement and is limited in scale (62 acres of ESH; 53 acres of variable thinning to create small gaps, and 46 acres of non-commercial thinning to improve oak composition). Additionally, because steep slopes, accessibility and other factors determine the layout of individual harvest units, the acres of proposal are often only a fraction (average of 70 percent) of the acres intended/or proposed for treatment. The Respondent's proposal includes the creation of early-successional habitat on 62 acres. Using average rates of layout to proposed acres of treatment (70 percent) , the proposal submitted by the Respondent would net 43 acres of ESH within an 11675 acre watershed dominated by late-successional forest. The small acreage of treatment makes this proposal economically impractical.</p> <p>An alternative to the Proposed Action has been developed which incorporates certain elements of the respondents proposed alternative. The newly developed alternative retains more overstory trees, gives preference to oaks for retention, addresses concerns about loss of mast and oak regeneration, and will provide a variety of habitat conditions for early and late-successional forest-dependent wildlife species. This Alternative is described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	storms will eventually produce canopy gaps and coarse woody debris. Cutting in this stand now would move it farther from its ecological potential.	
	680-022: Scarlet oaks usually do not have the opportunity to grow on this high a quality site. This stand has unusually large and well-formed mature scarlet oaks, and chestnut oak makes up most of the rest of the stand. Given the good condition of the stand and its current high wildlife value, harvesting it seems at odds with the goals of the 9.H prescription and the project.	
	680-039: We note that McClure Creek Road (796) is not among those listed for reconstruction. We hope this indicates that this stand is proposed for only non-commercial harvest. McClure Creek Road is very narrow and nearly the whole length would need to be reconstructed to allow commercial harvest, which would also be at odds with the recommendations of the TAP.	
	When this stand was selectively logged a few decades ago, that appears to have released the understory hemlock. While tuliptree, sweetgum, and white pine are locally important in the overstory, small hemlocks make up the overstory. These trees are already in decline from hemlock woolly adelgid, and the forest floor will soon be flooded with light. It seems a poor use of tax-payer resources to produce ESH in a location where nature is about to provide it for free.	
	681-013: Most of this stand exceeds 35% slope and large areas exceed 50%. Consequently, this stand is not appropriate for ground based logging. The stand is also relatively mature and has a species composition that is likely	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>fairly close to historical conditions. That structure and composition indicates this stand needs time more than anything else to reach its ecological potential. Other stands in the project area are better suited for producing ESH.</p> <p>681-015: This stand resembles 681-013 in topography, structure, and composition. As such, it is not suitable for ground-based logging, and would be a poor choice for ESH production.</p> <p>681-018: A mature oak canopy mixed with tuliptree in more mesic areas characterizes this stand. Abiotic conditions suggest historical species composition was likely similar to the current composition, except for the missing American chestnut. Hence, this is an essentially healthy stand. This stand already has high wildlife value, and that value will only increase as fungi and wind act on the large trees to produce canopy gaps and coarse woody debris. Harvesting this stand would move the area as a whole further from its ecological potential, and there are better alternatives for producing ESH.</p> <p>682-004: This stand generally resembles 681-013 and 681-014. The stand is mature with canopy gaps beginning to form naturally, which provide fine scale ESH. Cutting this stand for ESH would have wildlife habitat costs that could be reduced by harvesting other stands instead.</p> <p>682-007: Large parts of this stand have been converted to nearly pure tuliptree by repeated harvests. The original stand likely had many trees of other mesic site hardwoods such as basswood and white ash. Almost the entire stand is too steep for ground-based logging, with slopes over 35%, but a non-commercial thinning could foster diversity and begin</p>	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	restoration of this stand.	
	682-021: We did not have an opportunity to thoroughly investigate this stand, but the portions we saw make us believe that much of the stand is much older than the 41 years indicated by CISC. Mature oaks and other trees of high wildlife value appear common in this stand. Again this appears to be a stand that is already providing substantial wildlife habitat, so it is a poor choice for ESH treatment.	
	683-001: This stand is unusual in the project area in being a healthy stand on relatively flat ground. We also noted several shortleaf pines in the stand, a species that has been the target of restoration efforts elsewhere in the district. Cutting this stand appears counterproductive.	
	683-010: Multiple past harvests have left the composition of this stand strongly skewed towards early succession tree species, and the stand appears to have relatively low wildlife value. We believe the wildlife benefit of an ESH treatment in this stand would be among the greatest.	
	684-015: Slopes exceed 35% across almost the entire stand making it unsuitable for ground- based logging. Oaks near their mast producing prime also dominate this stand. Harvesting this stand would present an erosion risk and provide much less benefit to wildlife than cutting many other stands.	
	684-031: This stand has three distinct canopy layers reflecting three harvests in the stand. The lowest layer consists of early successional and understory species regenerating or released after the most recent harvest about 25 years ago. Tuliptrees	

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Rider, Anthony	<p>about 50 years old comprise a patchy intermediate layer. Finally, large scattered white pine and tuliptree regenerated following the industrial era of logging. Retaining that oldest layer would retain most of this stand's ability to generate cavity trees and large coarse woody debris. The other layers could be harvested to provide ESH and habitat values not currently available in this stand.</p>	
	<p>Conclusion</p> <p>Agree that retaining the White Oak for seeding is most beneficial for most large and small game animals within the area such as deer , bear , turkey and grouse.</p>	<p>Mid to late successional oak-dominated forest account for 29 percent of the acres in the project area (3423 acres). Oaks are also important associates in cove hardwoods stands which are present on nearly 5000 acres within the 11,675 acre project area. Mast production is not a limiting habitat attribute within the project area. However, early-successional forest habitats are.</p> <p>This project does not include management actions in oak-dominated stands. Proposed treatments are limited to mesic deciduous forest, dominated by yellow poplar or in white pine stands. Oaks are a varying component within proposed treatment areas.</p> <p>An alternative to the proposed action has been developed to address concerns related to the harvest and loss of mature oaks and their mast production. This alternative would retain more overstory trees , favor oaks for retention and enhance conditions for oak regeneration in some treatment areas. The effects of project alternatives on oak and mast production will be disclosed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Rider, Anthony	Also think the commercial timber sales from the project will help the economies of Gilmer and Fannin counties.	An economic analysis for project alternatives will be disclosed in Chapter 3 of the EA.
Rider, Anthony	Thanks for the opportunity to comment on what I feel is a great project and long over due. I hope this is one of many projects targeting creating Early Succession Habitat. 5,075 acres on the North and East slopes at the 2000-3500 feet elevation should be good for Ruffed Grouse whose population has been on the decline but not grouse only but all of the forest animals will be benefitted from such diversity that will result along edges of new and older growth habitats.	Thank you for your comments.
Riggins, Leslie	I urge you to avoid cutting healthy, mature forests as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project as you contemplate clearcutting 436 often-steep acres in Fannin County adjacent to the Mountaintown Roadless Area, and ask you to instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.
Roberts, Sid	I am in favor of your project and please proceed accordingly. I would also ask that you ignore the special interest groups that are trying to destroy wildlife habitat	Thank you for your comments.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Robinson, Olive	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Rocklin, Pam	<p>Good evening. I would like to voice my disapproval of the proposed cutting of trees from the forest. We bought our property in 2008 and have lived here full time for just over a year. While I am not an avid hunter, I do love the peace and quiet we enjoy here. I feel that this project will disrupt the current wildlife, not to mention the beauty of the landscape. It's not unusual for us to see deer and turkey. And while I have never actually seen a bear I know they are out there. I do appreciate the plight of the grouse I feel very strongly that each of species currently thriving in the forest are just as important. I urge you to reconsider this proposal.</p> <p>Thank you for your time.</p>	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Samuels, Stan	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Schmidt, Gisela	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Scott, Lynne	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Scott, Nancy	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Scruggs, Stuart	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. Thank you!	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Seehorn, Monte	This is an excellent proposal, and should significantly improve wildlife habitat conditions for all wildlife species in the general area. It will provide the stem densities required by a plethora of early successional species of wildlife while retaining a majority of mid to late successional habitat preferred by other species, some of which utilize the early successional habitat for specific activities or during certain stages of life	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Seehorn, Monte	<p>Table 2 shows a maximum of 484 acres desired for early successional habitat, while Table 3 shows only 436 acres selected. There may be some logical reason for the disparity, but, if possible, I recommend implementation be aimed at the higher figure.</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Seehorn, Monte	<p>You state that a minimum of 15 BA stems or trees be retained in the harvested areas. I recommend that 20 BA, as developed by the Forest Service Experiment Station (two age shelterwood), be the maximum number of stems retained in the harvested areas.</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Seehorn, Monte	<p>You stated that there would be a combination of commercial and non-commercial harvesting operations. I am adamantly opposed to spending taxpayer dollars to slash down trees if it is possible to have a commercial operation in or near the selected site, therefore I hope the majority of the project will be handled as commercial sales.</p>	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>
Seehorn, Monte	<p>The distribution of proposed harvest areas looks very good, and hopefully will meet the criteria as stated in the Forest Plan i.e. "Early successional habitat will be well distributed in all forest types, elevations, aspects, and slopes, including riparian corridors."</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Seehorn, Monte	<p>I understand that you are just trying to meet Forest Plan requirements with the 400+ acres of Old Growth, but it seems a little unreasonable to even have such a requirement when you consider that probably half or more of the District acreage is currently in some designation in which timber harvesting is restricted, including 40,000 acres in Wilderness! That's a lot of acreage when you consider that not one wildlife species on the Forest requires Old Growth to maintain a viable population!</p>	<p>The provision of a well-distributed and representative network of large, medium, and small potential old growth blocks is an important goal of the Forest Plan, and there are specific objectives and standards related to the designation of a certain percentage of each watershed (sixth level HUC unit) (Forest Plan pgs. 2-16-18). Incremental progress toward the designation of 5% of each watershed must be made at the project level.</p> <p>Timber may be salvaged after a catastrophe as needed, and native pests may be controlled under some conditions depending on the resource values at risk (Forest Plan pg. 3-107-108).</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Silverman, Alida	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Response to Comment (By Comment Author)

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Silverman, Alida	It seems that there are stands of younger woodlands nearby that need better management in order to be good habitat for wildlife.	Thank you for your comments.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Silverman, Alida	It is hard to believe that the Forest Service would even contemplate demolishing good, old forest when there are viable alternatives.	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Simmons, Penny	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Smith, Jill	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Smith, Roy	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Smith, Thomas	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Smith, Valerie	The Benton McCay Trail, the beauty of Fighting Town Creek, the beauty of trees that are 50 - 100 years old should all be considered .	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use. 2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly

Author(s)	Comment	Response
		<p>adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks. 4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller "feeder" or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA. 5. The user created trail into the Devil's Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns. 6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources. 7. Comments noted.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Smith, Valerie	The very fact that the forestry service would attempt to destroy habitat for a variety of wildlife's habitats in order to create a habitat for one / ruffed grouse is astounding	<p>There is a abundance of late-successional forest (stands over 80 years old) in the project area (and across the larger landscape) which provides habitat for a wide variety of plants and animals. Not all species occur in the same ecological niche, however, and there are many species that utilize young forests for some of their life stages or seasons. This fact is reflected in the Land and Resource Management Plan for the Chattahoochee-Oconee National Forests; it contains objectives to create and/or maintain a range of forest successional stages in order to provide for the needs of area wildlife, including those that are disturbance-dependent. Management Prescription 9.H contains a target range of early successional stage forest (4-10% of the prescription area) in order to provide habitat for species that require this type of habitat.</p>
Smith, Valerie	This area aside from the obvious beauty of a pristine wildlife habitat has a historical value	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use. 2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA. 3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated

Author(s)	Comment	Response
		<p>by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck “trips” along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller “feeder” or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA. 5. The user created trail into the Devil’s Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns. 6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources. 7. Comments noted.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Stansell, Jan & Dennis	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Stinson, Catherine	i encourage you to look into using already cut areas or very immature recently cut areas for your projects that need clearings. Please do not continue to make the mistake of cutting 50 plus year old trees.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Stovall, Merry	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Summers, Sylvia	Please stop the clear cutting of mature forests. Instead, you might consider young degraded stands of trees.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Sweeney, John	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Tacchi, Virginia	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Talmadge, Lynda	<p>I am writing to protest the Forest Service's plan to cut old growth forest in our area in order to increase habitat for grouse and other birds. It would be a terrible loss for the Chattahoochee National Forest to cut trees as old as 75-100 years old. If, in fact, trees need to be cleared, please cut sections that have already been degraded or cut. This only makes sense and you can restore grouse habitat with minimal impact on our old growth stands</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Talmadge, William	We greatly oppose such proposal because of the following: 1) the loss of beautiful old maturing forest;	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Response to Comment (By Comment Author)

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Talmadge, William	damage to our streams and creeks as previously happened along Fightingtown creek about 15 to 20 years ago when cutting was done	Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.

Response to Comment (By Comment Author)

274 of 311

12/13/2016 10:11:05 AM

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Talmadge, William	surely there are less mature forest away from the Fighttown creek habitat that may be managed for grouse and other bird species	<p>Late-successional forests (> 80 years old) are abundant in the Fightingtown Creek Project area. These forests account for nearly three-quarters of the forested acreage within the project area (8605 acres). Of these, over half or 4798 acres are older than 100 years old.</p> <p>The proposed action includes 436 acres of treatment, including 275 acres of timber harvest within late-successional forests (stands older than 80 years in age). Four stands, or 105 acres of treatment would occur in stands older than 100 years old . This represents 2 percent of all stands within the project area that are older than 100 years in age. None of the stands proposed for timber harvest can be defined as old-growth or are even within 20 years of meeting minimum age criteria for old-growth based on Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth.</p> <p>The proposed action does include the allocation of over 400 acres of forest stands to old growth conservation within the Fightingtown Creek Project Area. Stands best meeting the Forest Service, Region 8 guidelines for old-growth would be selected for old-growth conservation. The details of this process will be disclosed in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative is being developed that includes alternate harvest methods for creating the desired early-successional habitats within the project area. Harvest treatments included under this alternative would retain more mature overstory trees, favor large oaks for retention, and create a variety of habitat attributes within individual harvest units. This alternative will be described in the EA.</p>

Response to Comment (By Comment Author)

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Talmadge, William	As I look the map it appears you will be cutting adjacent to our property	If any of the proposed timber harvest is adjacent to private property, there will be site-specific design features (such the retention of a buffer or other techniques) based on the current land use of the private property and the type of harvesting proposed on National Forest.

Response to Comment (By Comment Author)

276 of 311

12/13/2016 10:11:05 AM

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Thacker, Wayne	<p>I write, as a Grouse hunter who travels quite a bit to find early successional habitat along our Central and Southern Appalachian mountains, to support the proposed Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project. This project will help restore early successional habitat at the southern range of our eastern Ruffed Grouse population and will benefit many other species (including the birder and wildlife enthusiast sub-species of H. sapiens). While Ruffed Grouse are not migratory, we Grouse hunters are -- I'd rather roam solely along our Appalachians than drive to the Chequamegon-Nicolet.</p> <p>The Fightingtown notice presents data that describes out of balance age classes and proposes to begin to restore that balance. Creating early successional habitat moves the forest closer to a natural mosaic and closer to forest plan goals and intent.</p> <p>As privately owned forest land becomes more fragmented, yields to development and mono cultural agriculture, and increasingly common hunting leases, all public lands become more important to wildlife enthusiasts and plant/animal species wholly or partially depended on a forest mosaic that includes early successional (young forest) habitat. Wildfire suppression and the lack of man-made disturbance by fire and other means makes active management on our national forests as per forest plans more important than ever -- multi-use for a variety of users. Even-age commercial harvests are an excellent method to achieve quality habitat and a balanced, vigorous forest.</p>	Thank you for your comments.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Thomas, John	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Thomas, Woody	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Thrift, Vince	I support the Fightingtown Creek Project #44961. These lands are in desperate need of early successional habitat to restore and prevent any further decline of many different bird species.	Thank you for your comments.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Train, Julia	Please stop clear cutting of this Georgia forest	<p>The even-aged harvest method described in the Proposed Action is an appropriate tool for creating the desired habitat conditions outlined in the purpose and need for the project.</p> <p>Size and distance between harvest units would comply with NFMA regulations. Although clusters of proposed treatment stands exceed 40 acres, it should be noted that much of the acreage within these stands would not be included due to steep slopes or accessibility. Exclusion of such areas will reduce overall size of the harvest units. Harvest units would not exceed 40 acres in size and would be separated by a minimum of 330 feet of mature forest.</p> <p>Proposed treatments all lie within Management Prescription 9.H which allows for up to 10 percent of the project area to be managed for early-successional habitats (ESH). The range of ESH that could be created within the project area in Management Prescription 9.H is given in the EA.</p> <p>Additionally, an alternative has been developed that includes alternate harvest methods to create ESH. These methods would retain more mature overstory trees, favor mast producing oaks, create a two-aged forest condition, and have less visual impact.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Truett, Meryl	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wagner, Steven	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Walker, Larry	I support the Fighting Town Creek plan and applaud the creation of grouse habitat (early succession stands).	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Walston, Lynn	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Walter, Abbie	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration. Would this not achieve the same objective?	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wappler, David	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Warnken, Ron	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Warren, Don	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The roads in this area are narrow and winding. It is difficult for large vehicles to make turns without crossing the center line. There are many blind driveways. Large logging vehicles would create a risk to residents of this area and especially to drivers unfamiliar with the roads, traveling through.2. Large logging vehicles would accelerate wear on the roads, and cause traffic issues.	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road

Warren, Don

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>3. Cashes Valley is a valuable recreational resource. The Cohutta Wilderness provides an invaluable recreational and ecological resource as well. The Benton MacKaye Trail is also a heavily used resource in the area</p>	<p>activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use.</p> <p>2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA.</p> <p>3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks.</p> <p>4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Warren, Don	Additional traffic involving logging vehicles would hinder use of these recreational areas.	<p>Creek, however, several smaller “feeder” or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. The user created trail into the Devil’s Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns. 6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources. 7. Comments noted. 1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use. 2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA. 3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Warren, Don	<p>4. Severe soil compaction will occur wherever the vehicles leave surfaced roadways and travel onto gravel roads and off-road surfaces.</p> <p>5. Soil compaction will increase runoff, causing more erosion, and siltation to streams.</p> <p>6. Soil erosion will cause slopes to become unstable. Many of the slopes in the areas to be logged are very steep. This exacerbates the soil erosion problem and landslides are a probable result.</p>	<p>primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks.</p> <p>4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller "feeder" or headwater streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA.</p> <p>5. The user created trail into the Devil's Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns.</p> <p>6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources.</p> <p>7. Comments noted.</p> <p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Warren, Don	<p>Excess siltation will increase stream discharges and cause flooding. Silt will cover gravel spawning areas, cloud the water causing nervous system stress for fish, reduce photosynthesis (reducing dissolved O₂), increase radiant heat absorption (reducing dissolved O₂), and also possibly change the water chemistry and pH.</p> <p>8. Many of the streams in the area are trout streams. Trout are very sensitive to increases in water temperature, decreases in dissolved O₂, and decreases in pH.</p>	<p>Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.</p>
Warren, Don	<p>9. Turtles in the project areas will be at risk from logging vehicles and road improvements will disrupt their movement</p>	<p>There is a abundance of late-successional forest (stands over 80 years old) in the project area (and across the larger landscape) which provides habitat for a wide variety of plants and animals. Not all species occur in the same ecological niche, however, and there are many species that utilize young forests for some of their life stages or seasons. This fact is reflected in the Land and Resource Management Plan for the Chattahoochee-Oconee National Forests; it contains objectives to create and/or maintain a range of forest successional stages in order to provide for the needs of area wildlife, including those that are disturbance-dependent. Management Prescription 9.H contains a target range of early successional stage forest (4-10% of the prescription area) in order to provide habitat for species that require this type of habitat.</p>
Warren, Don	<p>11. Grouse nest failure is very high. Only 25% of nests attempted are successful. One in four juvenile grouse survive. Predation eliminates 50-60% of the adult population each year. The main winter food source will be mountain laurel, which is low in nutrition</p>	<p>Predation and other environmental factors (weather and climate) are certainly important causes of ruffed grouse decline. These factors are closely linked to the importance of suitable habitat and the close juxtaposition of quality habitat components such as mature mast producing oaks, lush herbaceous groundcover for brood rearing, and dense patches with high stem density for breeding and escape cover.</p>
Warren, Don		<p>1. The USFS recognizes the potential for illegal off-road activities occurring in relation to roads created or</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
	<p>10. Noise pollution and dust generation will be a nuisance to the residents of the area, and to visitors recreating in the area</p>	<p>utilized in vegetation management. All temporary roads within the project area will be closed at the completion of the project utilizing earth berms embedded with large tree debris. During the project, roads will be monitored for unauthorized use.</p> <p>2. Treatment areas proposed off of FR 798 (stands 005,008, 009, 013,014 and 022) are primarily located in the lower lying areas and saddles, not on ridgelines. Visual effects will only be seen from areas directly adjacent to FR 798, which is gated year-round. Stands will be managed to meet or exceed the Scenic Integrity Objectives (High, Medium or Low) as related to their Inventoried Scenic Class. Any potential visual effects will be discussed in the final EA.</p> <p>3. The Cohutta Wilderness and Benton MacKaye Trail, and their related access points are located well away from this project area. Traffic, dust and noise generated by the logging vehicles will not hinder usage of these areas. The Cashes Valley and Fightingtown Creek areas do not contain any developed recreation such as trailheads, day use areas or campgrounds. Dispersed recreation in this area is primarily horseback riding on undesignated trails, and hunting/fishing. Use is primarily by area residents due to the limited road access, and is low overall when compared with other dispersed areas of the Forest. Any affects from dust and noise will be limited in both scope and duration, with an anticipated XXX of logging truck "trips" along the access route in a day, over a time period of XXX weeks.</p> <p>4. Fightingtown creek is acknowledged as a recreational resource for trout fishing. None of the proposed treatment areas are directly adjacent to Fightingtown Creek, however, several smaller "feeder" or headwater</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Warren, Don	12. The logging of trees removes nutrients that otherwise would used by forest organisms or absorbed into the soil.	<p>streams are. No cutting will occur within XXX feet of any of these feeder streams. Effects to soil and water will be discussed in the EA.</p> <p>5. The user created trail into the Devil’s Den area will be evaluated for resource concerns.</p> <p>6. All proposed treatment areas will be evaluated for the presence of cultural resources.</p> <p>7. Comments noted.</p> <p>The impacts of harvest removal in the soil will be analyze in the soil section of the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Washburn, Morning	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Watkins, Tom	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Weathersby, Randy	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Weaver, Joseph	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Weber, Stephen	<p>understand your intentions are good, but potentially short-sided. Cutting down a forest of established trees is not worth it. There is a better way.</p> <p>Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wheeler, Bruce	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wheeler, Kit	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead, please consider the possibility of cutting young, degraded stands and managing for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
White, Ellen	<p>Finally, please, please consider the effect of this cutting on adjacent stands the Forest Service clear cut 20, 30. 40 years ago. Those stands have regenerated in less diverse forest that provides low quality wildlife habitat. Would you please - instead of cutting healthy, mature forest - cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration?</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
White, Ellen	<p>I ask that you please remember the landslide on the road accessing several stands with large areas on steep slopes in the early 1990's - slopes well in excess of the limit in GA forestry best management practices.</p>	<p>The adverse impacts to the soil resources in the project area will be analyzed in the EA.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
White, Marvin	<p>This email is in support of the implementation of the Fightingtown Creek project. Our responsibility to be good stewards of the land really demand that this project get implemented. Those that feel that a forest is only healthy when it is edge to edge 100' tall trees don't have any understanding of the reality that old growth forest is for the most part a desert as far as the diversity and long term health of wildlife is concerned. I ask that you please do the right thing and go forward with this project.</p>	Thank you for your comments.
White, Marvin	<p>I trust that all care will be taken to preserve the integrity of the riparian zones in the area.</p>	Soil sedimentation and its impact to soil, water and aquatic resources will be analyzed in the EA.
White, Marvin	<p>This email is in support of the implementation of the Fightingtown Creek project. Our responsibility to be good stewards of the land really demand that this project get implemented. Those that feel that a forest is only healthy when it is edge to edge 100' tall trees don't have any understanding of the reality that old growth forest is for the most part a desert as far as the diversity and long term health of wildlife is concerned. I ask that you please do the right thing and go forward with this project. I trust that all care will be taken to preserve the integrity of the riparian zones in the area. Thanks for your efforts on behalf of the wildlife in our state</p>	Thank you for your comments.

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wilber, Martha	<p>I am a native Georgian, a bird watcher, a tree hugger and a hiker. I am writing to beg you please do not cut down our mature forests. I would love to see a ruffed grouse, but isn't there a better way to give them some habitat. PLEASE don't cut down our 100 year old forests.</p>	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Williams, Brandi	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Willingham, Kathy	PLEASE do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wilson, James	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wise, Steve	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Witt, Elise	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Wright, Teresa	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Yager, Timken	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p>
Yeager, Mark	I have seen ruffed grouse in a 75 yr old forest in the Daniel Boone National Fores	<p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p> <p>Predation and other environmental factors (weather and climate) are certainly important causes of ruffed grouse decline. These factors are closely linked to the importance of suitable habitat and the close juxtaposition of quality habitat components such as mature mast producing oaks, lush herbaceous groundcover for brood rearing, and dense patches with high stem density for breeding and escape cover.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Yeager, Mark	Please do not cut any healthy, mature forest as part of the Fightingtown Creek Wildlife Habitat Project; instead cut young, degraded stands and manage for restoration.	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>

Author(s)	Comment	Response
Youmans, Mickey	Please leave the oldest trees so that we might one day actually have an old growth forest again. There are plenty of young trees to cut	<p>The National Forest Management Act (NFMA) and other regulations require that National Forests be managed to support viable populations of native and desired non-native plants, fish, and wildlife within the planning area. These regulations focus on the role of active management in providing for species' viability. Timber harvest is a tool often utilized to create or improve wildlife habitat and maintain viable populations, particularly when a species or community is in decline. A young forest provides vital habitat for a suite of wildlife species, and young forests are not necessarily "degraded" because of their age or stage of successional development. The maintenance of a full range of successional stages is important in providing habitat for wildlife dependent on habitat other than old, mature forests.</p> <p>In the Fightingtown Creek project area, nearly three-quarters of the forest acreage is over 80 years old, and 41 percent is over 100 years old or older. This large block of mature forest is extremely valuable wildlife habitat; however, without periodic disturbance or regeneration of some forest habitat, viable populations of disturbance-dependent species are not provided for. This project proposes the regeneration of 436 acres, which is less than 1% of the project area.</p>
Young, Dewey	I support the proposed program for creating ESH areas in the National Forest. Wildlife generation requires new growth for sustenance and cover and there has been no ESH development in over 20 years. Georgia Wildlife must have these areas to avoid depletion of our wildlife resources.	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>